

CORESTA

**Task Force Genetically
Modified Tobacco –
Collaborative Study on
Quantitation Methods**

**PROFICIENCY TESTING TRIALS
FOR QUANTIFICATION OF GM
TOBACCO USING REAL-TIME
PCR**

Report to Participants

July 2003

CORESTA

**Task Force Genetically
Modified Tobacco –
Collaborative Study on
Quantitation Methods**

**PROFICIENCY TESTING TRIALS
FOR QUANTIFICATION OF GM
TOBACCO USING REAL-TIME
PCR**

Report to Participants

July 2003

Contact Point:

Nick Boley

Tel: +44 (0) 20 8943 7311

Prepared by:

Nick Boley

Neil Harris

Approved by:

Date:

Contact Points

1. General Enquiries

Nick Boley

(LGC) +44 (0) 20 8943 7311

Nick.boley@lgc.co.uk

2. Technical Enquiries

Neil Harris

(LGC) +44 (0) 20 8943 7675

Neil.harris@lgc.co.uk

Both rounds 1 and 2 were conducted in accordance with the project Protocol (October 2002). The cured tobacco leaf samples for round 1, together with calibration standards, primers and probes were despatched on March 27, 2002 with a result deadline of April 28, 2003. Out of the 12 possible participants all 12 submitted results. 35S primers and probes were included with each sample set, together with instructions for use, and a suggested extraction protocol. Participants were encouraged, however, to use their own procedures as the objective of a proficiency test is to study routine procedures used in participating laboratories.

A further set of cured tobacco leaf samples, together with calibration standards for round 2 were despatched on 17 June 2003 with a result deadline of 17 July 2003. Out of the 12 possible participants all 12 submitted results.

Samples were labelled A to G. The details of each sample are given below.

1.2 Sample Information

| Sample Identifier | Description Round 1 | Description Round 2 |
|-------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| A | 1.5% GM Tobacco | 0.5% GM Tobacco |
| B | 4.0% GM Tobacco | 1.5% GM Tobacco |
| C | 0.15% GM Tobacco | 0.8% GM Tobacco |
| D | 1.0% GM Tobacco | 2.0% GM Tobacco |
| E | 0.8% GM Tobacco | 4.0% GM Tobacco |
| F | 0.5% GM Tobacco | 1.0% GM Tobacco |
| G | 2.0% GM Tobacco | 0.15% GM Tobacco |

Participants were not given these sample descriptions; all samples were supplied “blind”.

Homogeneity Data

After homogenisation, samples were analysed by DNA extraction followed by real-time PCR amplification using primers designed to detect the 35S promoter. Two extractions were made on eight replicates of each sample, and two PCR analyses of each extract carried out.

The delta-CT values for each analysis were recorded, and the mean values for each extraction were subjected to the Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) to determine homogeneity. A summary of this data is given below:

| Test Sample (Round 1 designation) | Mean | Sample Standard Deviation (SSD) | Sampling Deviation (SD) | F-Ratio | F _{crit} for 8 replicates | Status |
|---|------|---------------------------------|-------------------------|---------|------------------------------------|--------|
| A | 8.14 | 0.647 | 0.254 | 1.3613 | 3.581 | OK |
| B | 3.20 | 0.320 | 0.150 | 1.5474 | 3.581 | OK |
| C | 8.26 | 0.594 | 0.113 | 0.9295 | 3.581 | OK |
| D | 5.31 | 0.283 | 0.078 | 1.1612 | 3.581 | OK |
| E | 6.47 | 0.570 | 0.225 | 1.3669 | 3.581 | OK |
| D | 7.04 | 1.428 | 0.247 | 0.9416 | 3.581 | OK |
| G | 4.37 | 0.169 | 0.047 | 1.1698 | 3.581 | OK |
| 0.1% GM standard | 8.38 | 0.532 | 0.398 | 3.3242 | 3.581 | OK |
| 5.0% GM standard | 3.41 | 0.408 | 0.408 | 2.2039 | 3.581 | OK |

All values for means and standard deviations are in delta-CT units.

All samples are sufficiently homogeneous for use in a proficiency testing trial.

Results and Evaluation

Round 1

SAMPLE A

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|------------------------|---------------------------|---------|---------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|-------------------------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % | 35S (In-house)/LGC Extraction | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 1.2 | -1.14 | | | | | | |
| 2 | | | 1.5 | 0.57 | 1.5 | 0.57 | | |
| 3 | | | 0.7 | -4.00 | | | | |
| 4 | 2.32 | >4 | | | | | | |
| 5 | 2.0 | 3.43 | 1.6 | 1.14 | 1.1 | -1.71 | 1.4 | 0.00 |
| 6 | 1.8 | 2.29 | 1.2 | -1.14 | | | | |
| 7 | 0.875 | -3.00 | | | | | | |
| 8 | 1.42 | 0.11 | 2.89 | >4 | 1.10 | -1.71 | | |
| 9 | 1.3 | -0.57 | 1.3 | -0.57 | 1.5 | 0.57 | | |
| 10 | 1.77 | 2.11 | 1.62 | 1.26 | 1.36 | -0.23 | | |
| 11 | 1.8 | 2.29 | 1.1 | -1.71 | 1.4 | 0.00 | | |
| 12 | >0.5 | | 0.5 | <-4 | | | | |
| # Results | 9 | | 9 | | 6 | | 1 | |
| Median | 1.77 | | 1.3 | | 1.38 | | 1.4 | |
| Mean | 1.61 | | 1.38 | | 1.33 | | 1.4 | |
| Robust SD | 0.52 | | 0.44 | | 0.18 | | 0 | |
| SD | 0.45 | | 0.69 | | 0.18 | | 0 | |
| Min Value | 0.88 | | 0.5 | | 1.1 | | 1.4 | |
| Max Value | 2.32 | | 2.89 | | 1.5 | | 1.4 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | | | 1.4 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | | | 0.175 | | | |
| Target value | | | | | 1.5 | | | |

SAMPLE B

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|------------------------|------------------------------|---------|------------------------------|---------|----------------|---------|--------------------------------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % | 35S (In- house)/LGC Extraction | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | >5 | | | | | | | |
| 2 | | | 5.0 | 2.00 | 5.0 | 2.00 | | |
| 3 | | | 2.4 | -3.20 | | | | |
| 4 | 4.85 | 1.70 | | | | | | |
| 5 | 5.4 | 2.80 | 4.6 | 1.20 | 4.8 | 1.60 | 4.4 | 0.80 |
| 6 | 3.0 | -2.00 | 3.2 | -1.60 | | | | |
| 7 | 3.389 | -1.22 | | | | | | |
| 8 | 3.98 | -0.04 | 4.39 | 0.78 | 3.33 | -1.34 | | |
| 9 | 4.0 | 0.00 | 4.0 | 0.00 | 4.2 | 0.40 | | |
| 10 | 3.81 | -0.38 | 3.48 | -1.04 | 3.34 | -1.32 | | |
| 11 | 4.2 | 0.40 | 1.5 | <-4 | 2.5 | -3.00 | | |
| 12 | >5 | | 10 | >4 | | | | |
| # Results | 8 | | 9 | | 6 | | 1 | |
| Median | 3.99 | | 4 | | 3.77 | | 4.4 | |
| Mean | 4.08 | | 4.29 | | 3.86 | | 4.4 | |
| Robust SD | 0.6 | | 1.19 | | 1.09 | | 0 | |
| SD | 0.76 | | 2.41 | | 0.97 | | 0 | |
| Min Value | 3 | | 1.5 | | 2.5 | | 4.4 | |
| Max Value | 5.4 | | 10 | | 5 | | 4.4 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | | | 4 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | | | 0.5 | | | |
| Target value | | | | | 4 | | | |

SAMPLE C

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|-------------------------------|------------------------------|---------|------------------------------|---------|----------------|---------|--------------------------------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % | 35S (In- house)/LGC Extraction | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | <0.1 | | | | | | | |
| 2 | | | 0.1 | -4.00 | 0.1 | -4.00 | | |
| 3 | | | 0.1 | -4.00 | | | | |
| 4 | 0.00 | <-4 | | | | | | |
| 5 | 0.2 | 0.00 | 0.1 | -4.00 | 0.2 | 0.00 | 0.3 | 4.00 |
| 6 | 0.2 | 0.00 | 0.2 | 0.00 | | | | |
| 7 | 0.156 | -1.76 | | | | | | |
| 8 | 0.12 | -3.20 | 0.27 | 2.80 | 0.32 | >4 | | |
| 9 | 0.2 | 0.00 | 0.2 | 0.00 | 0.2 | 0.00 | | |
| 10 | 0.32 | >4 | 0.29 | 3.60 | 0.26 | 2.40 | | |
| 11 | 0.3 | 4.00 | 0.3 | 4.00 | 0.2 | 0.00 | | |
| 12 | 0.2 | 0.00 | 0.1 | -4.00 | | | | |
| # Results | 9 | | 9 | | 6 | | 1 | |
| Median | 0.2 | | 0.2 | | 0.2 | | 0.3 | |
| Mean | 0.19 | | 0.18 | | 0.21 | | 0.3 | |
| Robust SD | 0.07 | | 0.15 | | 0.04 | | 0 | |
| SD | 0.09 | | 0.09 | | 0.07 | | 0 | |
| Min Value | 0 | | 0.1 | | 0.1 | | 0.3 | |
| Max Value | 0.32 | | 0.3 | | 0.32 | | 0.3 | |
| Median (all methods) | 0.2 | | | | | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | 0.025 | | | | | | | |
| Target value | 0.15 | | | | | | | |

SAMPLE D

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|------------------------|------------------------------|---------|------------------------------|---------|----------------|---------|--------------------------------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % | 35S (In- house)/LGC Extraction | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 1.6 | >4 | | | | | | |
| 2 | | | 0.5 | -4.00 | 0.5 | -4.00 | | |
| 3 | | | 0.8 | -1.60 | | | | |
| 4 | 1.98 | >4 | | | | | | |
| 5 | 1.2 | 1.60 | 0.8 | -1.60 | 1.1 | 0.80 | 1.0 | 0.00 |
| 6 | 1.20 | 1.60 | 0.80 | -1.60 | | | | |
| 7 | 0.465 | <-4 | | | | | | |
| 8 | 0.91 | -0.72 | 2.05 | >4 | 1.24 | 1.92 | | |
| 9 | 0.7 | -2.40 | 0.7 | -2.40 | 1.0 | 0.00 | | |
| 10 | 1.66 | >4 | 1.43 | 3.44 | 1.15 | 1.20 | | |
| 11 | 1.5 | 4.00 | 1.2 | 1.60 | 0.9 | -0.80 | | |
| 12 | 1 | 0.00 | 1 | 0.00 | | | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 9 | | 6 | | 1 | |
| Median | 1.2 | | 0.8 | | 1.05 | | 1.0 | |
| Mean | 1.22 | | 1.03 | | 0.98 | | 1.0 | |
| Robust SD | 0.52 | | 0.3 | | 0.19 | | 0 | |
| SD | 0.47 | | 0.47 | | 0.26 | | 0 | |
| Min Value | 0.47 | | 0.5 | | 0.5 | | 1.0 | |
| Max Value | 1.98 | | 2.05 | | 1.24 | | 1.0 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | | | 1.0 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | | | 0.125 | | | |
| Target value | | | | | 1.0 | | | |

SAMPLE E

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|------------------------|------------------------|---------|------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|--------------------------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % | 35S (In-house)/LG C Extraction | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 1.8 | >4 | | | | | | |
| 2 | | | 1 | 0.70 | 1 | 0.70 | | |
| 3 | | | 0.9 | -0.17 | | | | |
| 4 | 0.95 | 0.26 | | | | | | |
| 5 | 1.1 | 1.57 | 0.7 | -1.91 | 1.1 | 1.57 | 1.1 | 1.57 |
| 6 | 1.0 | 0.70 | 1.0 | 0.70 | | | | |
| 7 | 0.399 | <-4 | | | | | | |
| 8 | 0.89 | -0.26 | 0.55 | -3.22 | 0.90 | -0.17 | | |
| 9 | 0.6 | -2.78 | 0.6 | -2.78 | 0.7 | -1.91 | | |
| 10 | 0.95 | 0.26 | 0.94 | 0.17 | 0.59 | -2.87 | | |
| 11 | 0.8 | -1.04 | 0.8 | -1.04 | 0.6 | -2.78 | | |
| 12 | 2 | >4 | 2 | >4 | | | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 9 | | 6 | | 1 | |
| Median | 0.95 | | 0.9 | | 0.8 | | 1.1 | |
| Mean | 1.05 | | 0.94 | | 0.82 | | 1.1 | |
| Robust SD | 0.22 | | 0.15 | | 0.3 | | 0 | |
| SD | 0.49 | | 0.43 | | 0.22 | | 0 | |
| Min Value | 0.4 | | 0.55 | | 0.59 | | 1.1 | |
| Max Value | 2 | | 2 | | 1.1 | | 1.1 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | | | 0.92 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | | | 0.115 | | | |
| Target value | | | | | 0.8 | | | |

SAMPLE F

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|------------------------|------------------------------|---------|------------------------------|---------|----------------|---------|--------------------------------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % | 35S (In- house)/LGC Extraction | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 0.48 | -1.60 | | | | | | |
| 2 | | | 0.1 | <-4 | 0.1 | <-4 | | |
| 3 | | | 0.3 | -4.00 | | | | |
| 4 | 0.52 | -1.07 | | | | | | |
| 5 | 0.9 | 4.00 | 0.5 | -1.33 | 0.7 | 1.33 | 0.9 | 4.00 |
| 6 | 0.60 | 0.00 | 0.60 | 0.00 | | | | |
| 7 | 0.068 | <-4 | | | | | | |
| 8 | 0.57 | -0.40 | 0.74 | 1.87 | 0.60 | 0.00 | | |
| 9 | 0.4 | -2.67 | 0.4 | -2.67 | 0.5 | -1.33 | | |
| 10 | 0.77 | 2.27 | 1.21 | >4 | 0.48 | -1.60 | | |
| 11 | 0.6 | 0.00 | 0.7 | 1.33 | 0.6 | 0.00 | | |
| 12 | 5 | >4 | 5 | >4 | | | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 9 | | 6 | | 1 | |
| Median | 0.59 | | 0.6 | | 0.55 | | 0.9 | |
| Mean | 0.99 | | 1.06 | | 0.5 | | 0.9 | |
| Robust SD | 0.22 | | 0.3 | | 0.09 | | 0 | |
| SD | 1.43 | | 1.51 | | 0.21 | | 0 | |
| Min Value | 0.07 | | 0.1 | | 0.1 | | 0.9 | |
| Max Value | 5 | | 5 | | 0.7 | | 0.9 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | | | 0.6 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | | | 0.075 | | | |
| Target value | | | | | 0.5 | | | |

SAMPLE G

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|------------------------|---------------------------|---------|---------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|-------------------------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % | 35S (In-house)/LGC Extraction | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | >5 | | | | | | | |
| 2 | | | 2 | -0.06 | 2 | -0.06 | | |
| 3 | | | 1.2 | -3.24 | | | | |
| 4 | 3.96 | >4 | | | | | | |
| 5 | 2.6 | 2.32 | 2.0 | -0.06 | 2.5 | 1.93 | 2.6 | 2.32 |
| 6 | 2.30 | 1.13 | 3.0 | 3.91 | | | | |
| 7 | 0.472 | <-4 | | | | | | |
| 8 | 2.03 | 0.06 | 3.05 | >4 | 1.49 | -2.08 | | |
| 9 | 2.0 | -0.06 | 2.0 | -0.06 | 2.2 | 0.73 | | |
| 10 | 2.37 | 1.41 | 2.25 | 0.93 | 2.07 | 0.22 | | |
| 11 | 1.3 | -2.84 | 1.6 | -1.65 | 0.9 | <-4 | | |
| 12 | 1 | <-4 | >1 | | | | | |
| # Results | 9 | | 8 | | 6 | | 1 | |
| Median | 2.03 | | 2 | | 2.04 | | 2.6 | |
| Mean | 2 | | 2.14 | | 1.86 | | 2.6 | |
| Robust SD | 0.85 | | 0.48 | | 0.47 | | 0 | |
| SD | 1.02 | | 0.63 | | 0.57 | | 0 | |
| Min Value | 0.47 | | 1.2 | | 0.9 | | 2.6 | |
| Max Value | 3.96 | | 3.05 | | 2.5 | | 2.6 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | | | 2.015 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | | | 0.252 | | | |
| Target value | | | | | 2.0 | | | |

Comments on Results: Round 1

Overall, the quality of results reported were very good. No statistically significant differences were observed between the primers used by participants. A few trends were noted in the results submitted by individual laboratories:

Laboratory 1 reported high results for the samples containing higher levels of GM Tobacco.

Laboratory 7 reported low results for most samples.

Summary of Method Details

| Lab ID | Sample Weight (g) | Extraction methods used | Quantity of DNA used | Dilution factor | PCR cycles | In-house Primer details | Other Control Samples |
|--------|-------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|------------|---|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | 0.1-0.49 | In-house | ~100ng | 8% | - | - | Negative as supplied |
| 2 | 0.1-0.49 | In-house | 50ng | | 45 | 35S/NOS: Light cycler GMO Screening kit | Extraction blank negative control |
| 3 | 1.0-1.49 | In-house | n.a. | Undiluted | 50 | - | Negative control |
| 4 | <0.1 | Modified CTAB | 100ng | OD value of 260nm | - | - | - |
| 5 | 1.0-1.49 | LGC & In-house | 100ng | ~1:10 | 40 | - | - |
| 6 | Not given | | | | | | |
| 7 | <0.1 | QIAgen DNA extraction kit | 100-200ng | 1:5 | 40 | None | None |
| 8 | 0.1 | DNeasy Plant Kit Qiagen | 20-22ng | 4 | 50 | Multiplex systems | Extraction blanks OK |
| 9 | 0.1-0.49 | LGC supplied | 50ng | | 45 | | |

| | | | | | | | |
|-----------|----------|------------------------------|-------|-----------|----|-----------|-----------|
| 10 | <0.1 | LGC supplied | 100ng | TE buffer | 40 | See below | TE buffer |
| 11 | 0.1-0.49 | Dneasy Plant Mini Kit Qiagen | 80ng | | 50 | | |
| 12 | - | PR5700 | - | - | - | - | - |

ID 10: 35S

FW: 5'-CAGTGGTCCCAAAGATGGAC -3'

RV: 5'-GATAGTGGGATTGTGCGTCAT-3'

NOS FW: 5' GAATCCTGTTGCCGGTCTT- -3'

RV: 5'-TTGCGCGCTATATTTGTTT -3'

Results and Evaluation

Round 2

SAMPLE A (Round 2)

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|-------------------------------|------------------------|---------|------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 0.28 | <-4 | 0.32 | -3.62 | | |
| 2 | | | 0.40 | -2.53 | 0.40 | -2.53 |
| 3 | | | 0.9 | >4 | | |
| 4 | 0.601 | 0.22 | | | | |
| 5 | 0.4 | -2.53 | 0.4 | -2.53 | 0.4 | -2.53 |
| 6 | 0.60 | 0.21 | 0.50 | -1.16 | | |
| 7 | 0.12 | <-4 | | | | |
| 8 | 0.57 | -0.21 | 0.35 | -3.21 | 0.43 | -2.12 |
| 9 | 0.6 | 0.21 | 0.6 | 0.21 | 0.6 | 0.21 |
| 10 | 0.71 | 1.71 | 0.55 | -0.48 | 0.67 | 1.16 |
| 11 | 1.1 | >4 | 0.95 | >4 | 0.91 | >4 |
| 12 | 1.8 | >4 | 2 | >4 | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 10 | | 6 | |
| Median | 0.6 | | 0.53 | | 0.52 | |
| Mean | 0.68 | | 0.7 | | 0.57 | |
| Robust SD | 0.23 | | 0.22 | | 0.17 | |
| SD | 0.47 | | 0.51 | | 0.2 | |
| Min Value | 0.12 | | 0.32 | | 0.4 | |
| Max Value | 1.8 | | 2 | | 0.91 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | 0.59 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | 0.073 | | | |
| Target Value | | | 0.5 | | | |

SAMPLE B (Round 2)

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|-------------------------------|------------------------|---------|------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 1.39 | -0.03 | 1.57 | 1.00 | | |
| 2 | | | 1.20 | -1.12 | 1.20 | -1.12 |
| 3 | | | 1.2 | -1.12 | | |
| 4 | 1.249 | -0.84 | | | | |
| 5 | 0.9 | -2.84 | 1.0 | -2.27 | 1.1 | -1.69 |
| 6 | 1.30 | -0.54 | 1.40 | 0.03 | | |
| 7 | 0.28 | <-4 | | | | |
| 8 | 1.10 | -1.69 | 1.75 | 2.04 | 1.27 | -0.72 |
| 9 | 1.6 | 1.18 | 1.6 | 1.18 | 1.5 | 0.60 |
| 10 | 2.22 | >4 | 1.87 | 2.72 | 1.65 | 1.46 |
| 11 | 2.3 | >4 | 1.85 | 2.61 | 2.2 | >4 |
| 12 | 1.5 | 0.60 | 0.98 | -2.38 | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 10 | | 6 | |
| Median | 1.35 | | 1.49 | | 1.39 | |
| Mean | 1.38 | | 1.44 | | 1.49 | |
| Robust SD | 0.37 | | 0.42 | | 0.33 | |
| SD | 0.59 | | 0.34 | | 0.4 | |
| Min Value | 0.28 | | 0.98 | | 1.1 | |
| Max Value | 2.3 | | 1.87 | | 2.2 | |
| Median (all methods) | 1.4 | | | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | 0.174 | | | | | |
| Target value | 1.5 | | | | | |

SAMPLE C (Round 2)

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|-------------------------------|------------------------|---------|------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 0.67 | -1.26 | 0.69 | -1.06 | | |
| 2 | | | 0.62 | -1.76 | 0.62 | -1.76 |
| 3 | | | 2.9 | >4 | | |
| 4 | 0.652 | -1.44 | | | | |
| 5 | 0.6 | -1.96 | 0.6 | -1.96 | 0.6 | -1.96 |
| 6 | 0.50 | -2.97 | 0.70 | -0.96 | | |
| 7 | 0.19 | <-4 | | | | |
| 8 | 0.61 | -1.86 | 1.45 | >4 | 1.06 | 2.67 |
| 9 | 1 | 2.06 | 1 | 2.06 | 0.9 | 1.06 |
| 10 | 1.32 | >4 | 1.14 | 3.47 | 0.89 | 0.96 |
| 11 | 1.2 | >4 | 0.95 | 1.56 | 1.0 | 2.06 |
| 12 | 0.08 | <-4 | 1.0 | 2.06 | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 10 | | 6 | |
| Median | 0.63 | | 0.98 | | 0.9 | |
| Mean | 0.68 | | 1.11 | | 0.85 | |
| Robust SD | 0.37 | | 0.42 | | 0.2 | |
| SD | 0.4 | | 0.68 | | 0.19 | |
| Min Value | 0.08 | | 0.6 | | 0.6 | |
| Max Value | 1.32 | | 2.9 | | 1.06 | |
| Median (all methods) | 0.8 | | | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | 0.099 | | | | | |
| Target value | 0.8 | | | | | |

SAMPLE D (Round 2)

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|-------------------------------|------------------------|---------|------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 2.03 | 0.88 | 1.92 | 0.40 | | |
| 2 | | | 0.77 | <-4 | 0.77 | <-4 |
| 3 | | | 0.3 | <-4 | | |
| 4 | 1.856 | 0.12 | | | | |
| 5 | 1.7 | -0.56 | 1.5 | -1.44 | 1.7 | -0.56 |
| 6 | 1.30 | -2.31 | 1.50 | -1.44 | | |
| 7 | 0.38 | <-4 | | | | |
| 8 | 2.60 | 3.38 | 3.10 | >4 | 1.80 | -0.12 |
| 9 | 2.3 | 2.07 | 2.3 | 2.07 | 2.3 | 2.07 |
| 10 | 3.51 | >4 | 2.41 | 2.55 | 2.09 | 1.15 |
| 11 | 0.9 | <-4 | 0.9 | <-4 | 0.8 | <-4 |
| 12 | 2 | 0.75 | 2.25 | 1.85 | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 10 | | 6 | |
| Median | 1.93 | | 1.71 | | 1.75 | |
| Mean | 1.86 | | 1.7 | | 1.58 | |
| Robust SD | 0.74 | | 0.96 | | 0.66 | |
| SD | 0.88 | | 0.86 | | 0.65 | |
| Min Value | 0.38 | | 0.3 | | 0.77 | |
| Max Value | 3.51 | | 3.1 | | 2.3 | |
| Median (all methods) | 1.83 | | | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | 0.229 | | | | | |
| Target value | 2 | | | | | |

SAMPLE E (Round 2)

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|------------------------|---------------------------|---------|---------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 4.65 | 1.79 | 3.79 | -0.02 | | |
| 2 | | | 1.50 | <-4 | 1.50 | <-4 |
| 3 | | | 1.2 | <-4 | | |
| 4 | 3.508 | -0.61 | | | | |
| 5 | 3.8 | 0.00 | 3.8 | 0.00 | 3.9 | 0.21 |
| 6 | 3.80 | 0.00 | 3.80 | 0.00 | | |
| 7 | 0.62 | <-4 | | | | |
| 8 | 3.80 | 0.00 | 3.26 | -1.14 | 2.75 | -2.21 |
| 9 | 4 | 0.42 | 4 | 0.42 | 3.8 | 0.00 |
| 10 | 6.50 | >4 | 3.98 | 0.38 | 3.3 | -1.05 |
| 11 | 6.1 | >4 | 5.9 | >4 | 6.1 | >4 |
| 12 | 4.21 | 0.86 | 4.8 | 2.11 | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 10 | | 6 | |
| Median | 3.9 | | 3.8 | | 3.55 | |
| Mean | 4.1 | | 3.6 | | 3.56 | |
| Robust SD | 0.52 | | 0.55 | | 0.85 | |
| SD | 1.59 | | 1.39 | | 1.52 | |
| Min Value | 0.62 | | 1.2 | | 1.5 | |
| Max Value | 6.5 | | 5.9 | | 6.1 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | 3.8 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | 0.475 | | | |
| Target value | | | 4.0 | | | |

SAMPLE F (Round 2)

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|-------------------------------|------------------------|---------|------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 0.16 | <-4 | 0.16 | <-4 | | |
| 2 | | | 0.75 | -2.00 | 0.75 | -2.00 |
| 3 | | | 3.0 | >4 | | |
| 4 | 1.305 | 2.44 | | | | |
| 5 | 1.0 | 0.00 | 0.9 | -0.80 | 0.7 | -2.40 |
| 6 | 0.70 | -2.40 | 1.10 | 0.80 | | |
| 7 | 0.22 | <-4 | | | | |
| 8 | 1.30 | 2.40 | 1.10 | 0.80 | 1.30 | 2.40 |
| 9 | 1.2 | 1.60 | 1.2 | 1.60 | 1 | 0.00 |
| 10 | 1.93 | >4 | 1.12 | 0.96 | 1.13 | 1.04 |
| 11 | 1.0 | 0.00 | 0.8 | -1.60 | 1.04 | 0.32 |
| 12 | 0.4 | <-4 | 0.5 | -4.00 | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 10 | | 6 | |
| Median | 1 | | 1 | | 1.02 | |
| Mean | 0.92 | | 1.06 | | 0.99 | |
| Robust SD | 0.45 | | 0.3 | | 0.28 | |
| SD | 0.56 | | 0.75 | | 0.23 | |
| Min Value | 0.16 | | 0.16 | | 0.7 | |
| Max Value | 1.93 | | 3 | | 1.3 | |
| Median (all methods) | 1.0 | | | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | 0.125 | | | | | |
| Target value | 1.0 | | | | | |

SAMPLE G (Round 2)

| Lab ID | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | | GM Tobacco | |
|-------------------------------|------------------------|---------|------------------------|---------|-------------|---------|
| | 35S Primers (supplied) | % | 35S Primers (In-house) | % | Nos Primers | % |
| | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score | Result | Z Score |
| 1 | 0.99 | >4 | 0.91 | >4 | | |
| 2 | | | 0.38 | >4 | 0.38 | >4 |
| 3 | | | 0.0 | <-4 | | |
| 4 | 0.129 | -2.42 | | | | |
| 5 | 0.1 | -3.68 | 0.1 | -3.68 | 0.1 | -3.68 |
| 6 | 0.12 | -2.81 | 0.14 | -1.95 | | |
| 7 | 0.067 | <-4 | | | | |
| 8 | 0.23 | 1.95 | 0.21 | 1.08 | 0.15 | -1.51 |
| 9 | 0.2 | 0.65 | 0.2 | 0.65 | 0.2 | 0.65 |
| 10 | 0.32 | >4 | 0.18 | -0.22 | 0.19 | 0.22 |
| 11 | 0.13 | -2.38 | 0.09 | <-4 | 0.1 | -3.68 |
| 12 | 0.7 | >4 | 0.8 | >4 | | |
| # Results | 10 | | 10 | | 6 | |
| Median | 0.17 | | 0.19 | | 0.17 | |
| Mean | 0.3 | | 0.3 | | 0.19 | |
| Robust SD | 0.1 | | 0.14 | | 0.07 | |
| SD | 0.3 | | 0.31 | | 0.1 | |
| Min Value | 0.07 | | 0 | | 0.1 | |
| Max Value | 0.99 | | 0.91 | | 0.38 | |
| Median (all methods) | | | 0.19 | | | |
| Acceptability criteria | | | 0.023 | | | |
| Target value | | | 0.15 | | | |

Comments on Results: Round 2

Overall, the quality of results reported were very good, but with a few unexpected results. Some laboratories had improved their results from the first round. The overall quality of results was not statistically significantly different from the first round. No statistically significant differences were observed between the primers used by participants. A few trends were noted in the results submitted by individual laboratories, and some of the unexpected results may have been reporting (i.e. non-analytical) errors.

Summary of Method Details

| Lab ID | Sample Weight (g) | Extraction methods used | Quantity of DNA used | Dilution factor | PCR cycles | In-house Primer details | Other Control Samples |
|--------|-------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|------------|---|--|
| 1 | <0.1 | In-house | ~100ng | 8% | 40 | Not stated | Negative as supplied and in-house negative |
| 2 | 0.1-0.49 | In-house | 50ng | | 45 | 35S/NOS: Light cycler GMO Screening kit | Extraction blank negative control |
| 3 | 0.1-0.49 | - | Unknown | 1:8 | 50 | Not given | No samplecontrol |
| 4 | <0.1 | Modified CTAB | 300ng/25μl | OD value of 260nm | 40 | - | - |
| 5 | 1.0-1.49 | In-house | 100ng | ~1:10 | 40 | - | - |
| 6 | 0.5-0.99 | In-house | - | - | - | - | - |
| 7 | <1.0 | QIAgen DNA extraction kit | 100-200ng | 5x | 40 | None | None |
| 8 | 0.1 | DNeasy Plant Kit Qiagen | 20-22ng | 4 | 50 | Multiplex systems | Extraction blanks OK |
| 9 | 0.1-0.49 | LGC supplied | 50ng | | 45 | | |
| 10 | <0.1 | LGC supplied | 100ng | 260OD | 40 | See below | TE buffer |
| 11 | 0.1-0.49 | Dneasy Plant Mini | 80ng | | 50 | | |

| | | | | | | | |
|-----------|---------|---------------|-----------|---|----|-----------|---|
| | | Kit Qiagen | | | | | |
| 12 | 0.1-0.3 | ABI PE5700 | 100-200ng | - | 40 | See below | - |

ID 10: 35S

FW: 5'-CAGTGGTCCCAAAGATGGAC -3'

RV: 5'-GATA GTGGGATTGTGCGTCAT-3'

NOS FW: 5' GAATCCTGTTGCCGGTCTT- -3'

RV: 5'-TTGCGCGCTATATTTGTTT -3'

ID 12: 35s208.SEQ-64F: sequence GACAGTGGTCCCAAAGATGGA

35s208.SEQ-139R: sequence TTGAAGACGTGGTTGGAACGT